

The background of the book cover is a vibrant, abstract image. It features a bright, glowing yellow and orange light source on the left side, which appears to be illuminating a dark, textured surface that slopes downwards from left to right. The overall color palette is dominated by deep blues and purples, with streaks of red and orange light scattered throughout, creating a sense of depth and energy. The text is overlaid on this background in a clean, white, sans-serif font.

FROM CRUST TO CORE

**A Chronicle of
Deep Carbon
Science**

Simon Mitton

Foreword

I came to know the curious, absorbent and learned Simon Mitton in 2012, when Simon completed the editing and publication of *Taking the Back off the Watch: A Personal Memoir* of the scientist Thomas Gold. As a graduate student of Nobel Prize-winning astronomer Martin Ryle during a rather turbulent time and a historian of science at the University of Cambridge, Simon knew Tommy, who was conjecturing about the origin of very distant radio signals. Following Tommy's death in 2004, Simon worked closely with Tommy's widow, Carvel, to bring the memoir to fruition.

In 1995, grants from the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation supported Gold in writing a book based on his path-breaking 1992 paper in the *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* paper, "The Deep, Hot Biosphere." Gold's 1999 book, *The Deep Hot Biosphere: The Myth of Fossil Fuels*, addressed controversial questions, including the possibility that life originated deep in Earth rather than in a warm little pond on its surface or extraterrestrially, arriving from space on a comet or meteorite. It also argued that a large fraction of Earth's hydrocarbons (natural gas, oil and coal) had primordial, abiotic origins and accumulated in the crust from upward outgassing rather than forming as "fossil fuels" from the shallow burial of biomass during the Jurassic and other epochs.

While the Foundation took no position on Gold's propositions, Sloan president Ralph Gomory (1990–2007), mathematician and former chief of research for IBM, believed that big questions of the kind Gold raised usefully stimulated science. Sloan also supported *Renegade Genius*, a television documentary on Gold that appeared in 2009, five years after Gold had passed away.

In 2007, geologist Robert Hazen (Carnegie Institution for Science, Washington, DC) published the book *Genesis*, aimed at

public understanding of questions associated with the origins of life. The book came to my attention as a Sloan program manager who had handled Sloan's grants with Gold. Hazen's book dispassionately weighed evidence for and against several of Gold's propositions, as well as pointing to other major unanswered questions in the geosciences, including the ecology and evolution of minerals.

Sloan invited and provided funds to Hazen to organize a May 2008 conference to explore the limits of knowledge (the known, unknown and unknowable) of deep carbon science, which Hazen did together with his colleague, Russell Hemley, then director of Carnegie's Geophysical Laboratory and an expert in materials under extremely high pressures, as in Earth's interior. In the interim, MIT microeconomist Paul Joskow had assumed the presidency of Sloan. President Joskow had a keen interest in energy resources and a long-standing relationship with Richard Meserve, president of the Carnegie Institution and former head of the US Nuclear Regulatory Commission. The May 2008 meeting proved very lively. President Joskow asked me to consult experts and stakeholders and to prepare an internal strategy paper for a 10-year international initiative about deep carbon science to be anchored by funding from Sloan and to convene an expert group to vet the strategy.

Among those consulted and immediately enthusiastic were earthquake expert, former Sloan Trustee and National Academy of Sciences president Frank Press and also Walter Munk (Scripps Institution of Oceanography), who helped start the international program for drilling in the seafloor during the 1960s, about which Simon writes in Chapters 8 and 9. Gold's former colleague John Saul (geologist) and student Steven Soter (astronomer) also provided advice and impetus. Favorable vetting resulted in an invitation in early 2009 from Sloan to Carnegie for a three-year US\$4 million grant to initiate a major program in deep carbon science, spanning biology as well as solid-earth sciences. Hemley suggested the framework of a "Deep Carbon Observatory" (DCO) to emphasize the importance of making new measurements. The Sloan Trustees approved the grant in

June 2009, and the DCO officially came into existence on July 1, 2009, with Hazen as lead scientist and Hemley chairing a distinguished international steering committee. Founding members included John Baross (USA), Taras Bryndzia (Australia/USA), Claude Jaupart (France), Adrian Jones (UK), Barbara Sherwood Lollar (Canada), Eiji Ohtani (Japan) and Sergei Stishov (Russia). An administrative secretariat was established at Carnegie. Assuming the DCO proceeded very well, the Sloan Trustees committed to provide about US\$5 million a year for 10 years, a total of about \$50 million.

Over the next two years, a series of workshops led to the emergence of four communities to carry out the work of the DCO: Deep Life; Deep Energy; Reservoirs and Fluxes; and Extreme Physics and Chemistry. Each community prepared a set of "decadal goals" to achieve by the end of 2019 and agreed to organize the work along the four themes of origins, quantities, movements and forms. Cross-community teams concerned with data science and with engagement (communications and community building) were formed in 2011–2012. Early grant-making focused on instrument development, using both open, competitive calls for proposals and invited proposals. Subsequently, the majority of Sloan DCO funding was used to support a global network of graduate students and postdocs. Much effort went into community building: for example, cultivation of DCO support in Germany, France, Italy, the UK, Russia, China and Japan, as well as the USA; development of a website for both internal and external purposes; and giving the DCO a recognizable identity and family feeling. The program used the major international meetings in geosciences (especially the annual meeting of the American Geophysical Union and the annual Goldschmidt conference in geochemistry) to bring together the growing network of participants in the DCO.

At the outset of the program, Sloan asked the DCO to prepare a report that would describe the baseline of knowledge about deep carbon and that could be used to help measure progress achieved by 2019. The DCO leadership chose to try to create not only a

benchmark, but a landmark, and in 2013, they published the 20-chapter, 698-page open access volume, *Carbon in Earth*. Released at an "all-program" meeting of close to 200 people at the US National Academy of Sciences in Washington, DC (March 2013), along with a press release summarizing the DCO's goals, the volume also served to attract many more scientists to the DCO network, which grew to about 500 by the end of 2013. A December 2013 press release highlighted early discoveries. The December 2014 Mid-term Scientific Report by Hemley summarized the first five years of the program. Subsequent all-program meetings took place in Munich (April 2015) and St. Andrews (March 2017).

A question early in the DCO decade was whether to foster an effort to drill through the crust into the mantle, as was strongly advocated by Japanese members. After the spring 2011 Tohoku earthquake, Japan deferred interest in this "Mohole."

During 2014, Sloan organized a far-reaching mid-term review by an external group of experts who had no stake in the DCO. The review led to major additions and changes in the program, including formation of a new group to take responsibility for synthesis, led by Cambridge volcanologist Professor Marie Edmonds, to whom Simon dedicates this book. The Synthesis Group and much of the strategic management of the DCO were handled by a team at the University of Rhode Island led by Sara Hickox and later Darlene Trew Crist. The Rhode Island team skillfully organized an October 2015 workshop that formulated most of the synthesis activities of the DCO. Creatively, they invited Simon to offer a historian's perspective on the DCO, which he did during a lively and provocative evening session. Sloan then invited Simon to submit a proposal to write a history of deep carbon science to place the DCO in context. The happy result is this book, which spans from the center of Earth to faraway habitable planets, with rich intervals in Europe during the Renaissance and Enlightenment, as well as the contemporary archipelagos of global research.

During 2015–2019, the active membership of the DCO network reached a total of about 1200 scientists from about 50 nations. In the later years, the substantial flow of DCO peer-reviewed publications included numerous papers in *Science*, *Nature* and other prestigious outlets. Under Edmonds and Trew Crist's leadership, a 50-page decadal report, press releases, special issues of journals and hundreds of other articles, as well as videos and blogs and two other books reachable at deepcarbon.net, summarize the work of the program. Although tracking matching and leveraged funds is difficult because of different forms of funding in different nations and for other reasons, a cautious estimate is that US\$200–\$250 million in funds from other sources complemented US\$57 million that Sloan spent on the DCO program between 2009 and the culminating events in the fall of 2019.

I first met Tommy Gold in about 1983. In subsequent years, he would appear unexpectedly at my office at The Rockefeller University, having arrived on the Big Red Bus that shuttles Cornell University faculty and students between the main campus in rural Ithaca, New York, and the Manhattan campus. He would speak for an hour or so about abiotic methane, or the possible deep origin of life, or the formation of diamonds, and then abruptly depart. I believe Tommy was a Renegade Genius, and that even Tommy, who was schismatic, would have admired the contributions of the DCO, of which he was the progenitor. And he would especially have liked this book of Simon Mitton, which shows vividly how the matter of deep carbon has arrived as a science through the overthrow of received ideas.

Jesse H. Ausubel

Science Advisor to the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation for the Deep Carbon Observatory; Director, Program for the Human Environment, The Rockefeller University

From Crust to Core

A Chronicle of Deep Carbon Science

SIMON MITTON

University of Cambridge



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108426695

DOI: 10.1017/9781316997475

© Simon Mitton 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-42669-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Foreword	<i>page</i> xii
Acknowledgments	xvii
Introduction	1
1 Why Carbon in Earth Matters	4
Foundation of the Deep Carbon Observatory	4
Spheres Below and Heavens Above	7
Looking Down on Earth	11
The Invention of Earth System Science	14
Environmentalists Shake Up Humanity	16
Global Warming and Deep Carbon	18
Jules Verne Imagines Earth's Dynamic Interior	20
2 The Origin of Deep Carbon in Deep Space	22
Carbon Is Universal	22
It Started with a Big Bang!	23
Stellar Origin of the Chemical Elements	25
Origin of Carbon in the Universe	29
Exploding Stars Seed Space with Carbon	34
Giant Molecular Clouds	36
Formation of the Solar System	38
Making Rocky Planets	40
Thwack! Moon Making	43
3 Deliveries of Cosmic Carbon Continue	45
Adding the Volatiles, Carbon and Water	45
Carbonaceous Chondrites Carry Carbon	48

	Organic Riches in the Murchison Meteorite	57
	Cosmic Carbon Chemistry	58
4	On the Nature of Earth's Interior	62
	Inquiring about Earth in Antiquity	62
	Mining Deep Earth Begins	64
	Earth's Magnetic Attraction	71
	Edmond Halley Investigates Geomagnetism	72
	Henry Cavendish Weighs Earth	75
5	Earth's Physical Interior Revealed	77
	"The Most Ingenious Book I Ever Read"	77
	Stratigraphy: A Layered Approach to Earth History	79
	The Coal Prospector and the Geological Map	81
	Defining the Order of the Strata	85
	The First Large-Scale Geological Map	88
	Professing Earth Science	89
	The Magnetic Crusade: The First International Geophysical Survey	92
6	Thousands, Millions or Billions: The Question of Timing	97
	Reading Nature's Archives	97
	Deep Time and Nature's Deep History	100
	Ussher and the Age of Earth	101
	"Drawing Large Cheques upon the Bank of Time"	102
	Antoine-Laurent de Lavoisier: Combustion and Respiration	106
	Is Coal's Origin Biogenic?	110
	Paris: A Walk in the Park	111
	Charles Darwin: Geologist and Natural Historian	112
	Evolution by Natural Selection	114
7	Physics and Chemistry of Deep Earth	119
	Fixing the Age of Earth	119
	Radioactivity Raises the Stakes	125

7	The Curies Discover the Source of Earth's	
3	Internal Heating	127
	Radioactive Clocks Locked in Rocks	130
2	Arthur Holmes Dates Earth	134
2	Earth's Dynamic Deep Interior	138
4	Isotopes Extend the Geological Timescale	139
1		
2	8 Confronting the Continental Drift Conundrum	147
5	"What We Are Witnessing Is the Collapse of the World"	147
	Alfred Wegener Shifts the Worldview	149
7	Seeing Off Opponents, Seeking Scarce Supporters	152
7	Holmes Warms to Continental Drift	158
0	Why Did It All Take So Long and What Was Learned?	163
1		
5	9 The Mid-Atlantic Ridge and Rift Valley	167
3	The Foundations of Oceanography	167
0	The <i>Challenger</i> Expedition, 1872–1876	169
	Finding the Mid-Atlantic Ridge and the	
2	Mariana Trench	173
	The Postwar Bonanza for Geosciences	175
	Günther Dietrich Profiles the Ridge and the Central	
7	Rift Valley	176
7	Harry Hess: "Drowned Islands of the Pacific Basin"	178
0	Maurice Ewing: "I Keep My Ship at Sea"	180
	The Heezen–Tharp Map, 1957	184
1	The Geopoetry of Harry Hess, 1962	187
5	Robert Dietz: The Seafloor Is a Conveyor Belt	191
0		
1	10 Earth's Deep Dynamics Discovered	194
1	Seismology Digs Deep to the Core	194
4	The Physicists and the Dynamo	196
	Paleomagnetism and the History of Rocks	199
0	Pioneering Geomagnetism at the Carnegie Institution	201
0	Apparent Wandering of the Geomagnetic Field	204
5	Drifting, Not Wandering	206

X CONTENTS

11	Reversals of Fortune	211
	Dating Geomagnetic Reversals	211
	Mapping the Magnetic Seafloor	213
	Lawrence Morley's "Eureka!" Moment	217
	Fred Vine's "Eureka!" Moment	220
	Players in the Endgame, 1963–1968	223
	The Final Chorus	227
12	Deep Carbon: Cycles, Reservoirs and Fluxes	234
	The Jigsaw Slots Together	234
	Ring of Fire	236
	Inventing Volcanology	238
	Jacques-Joseph Ébelmen: Deep Carbon Cycle Pioneer	242
	Breathing New Life into Deep Carbon Science	246
	Box Models of the Long-Term Carbon Cycle	248
	Quantifying Reservoirs and Fluxes	254
	2009–2019: Decade of Deep Carbon Discovery	256
13	Carbon-Bearing Phases in the Mantle	261
	Inventing High-Pressure Physics and Chemistry	261
	Diamond Synthesis: Seeking the Holy Grail	264
	Carnegie Geophysical Laboratory: High-Pressure Mineralogy	268
	Geoscientists Are Attracted to High-Pressure Research	271
	Five Reactions and the Deep Carbon Cycle	272
	Carbon Mineral Evolution	275
	The Carbon Mineral Challenge	277
14	Diamond in the Mantle	282
	Delving Deep for Diamond	282
	Diamond in Kimberlite	286
	Cecil Rhodes: Founder of the Modern Diamond Industry	289
	Kimberlite and the Formation of Diamond	292

CONTENTS xi

1	Dating Diamonds	294
1	Origin of the Largest Gem Diamonds	296
3		
7	15 Deep Life	303
10	Signs of Deep Life	303
13	Drilling Down in Sweden	307
17	Subterranean Life in Deep Mines	309
	Deep Marine Sediment Communities	312
14	Marine Bacteria and Biofilms	313
34	Dredging and Drilling the Deep	314
36	Deep Marine Life at Hydrothermal Vents	315
38	Thomas Gold Proposes the Deep, Hot Biosphere	323
42	Drilling to the Deep Biosphere	324
46	Epilogue	328
48		
54	Glossary	333
56	Biographical Notes	341
	Index	354
51		
61		
64		
68		
71		
72		
75		
77		
82		
.82		
.86		
.89		
.92		